

STATE OF MICHIGAN  
BEFORE THE MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the matter, on the Commission's own motion,  
to facilitate the implementation of the Federal  
Communications Commission's Triennial Review  
determination in Michigan.

---

U-13796

**MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION STAFF'S FIRST DISCOVERY  
REQUEST TO ALL TELECOMMUNICATIONS CARRIERS  
LICENSED IN MICHIGAN**

The Staff of the Michigan Public Service Commission, by its attorney, Steven D. Hughey, Assistant Attorney General, submits, pursuant to R 460.17317 (Rule 317) of the Commission Rules and Practice and Procedure, the following discovery request to all telecommunications carriers licensed in Michigan. This request is being made to assist the Michigan Public Service Commission in facilitating the implementation of the Federal Communications Commission's Triennial Review determination in Michigan.

**INSTRUCTIONS**

- A. If you have not received this discovery request in an electronic format (by e-mail) and wish to receive an electronic version, submit your e-mail address to [pagelsmr@michigan.gov](mailto:pagelsmr@michigan.gov).
- B. Please follow the instructions which accompany each discovery request (i.e. spreadsheet).
- C. A copy of the protective order adopted by the parties to this case accompanies this request.

## INSTRUCTIONS for "switching\_questions.xls"

Michigan Public Service Commission Staff Switching Questions (for both ILECs and CLECs). All licensed telecommunication carriers operating in SBC territory should answer these questions within 14 days of service.

### FCC Rules, Section 51.319 (d) (2)

#### General Instructions

The trigger information requested is to be provided on an electronic spreadsheet: "switching\_questions.xls". This spreadsheet includes a few rows of example entries. Respondents should remove the example information before entering their own information. The number of spreadsheet rows which each ILEC and CLEC will be required to provide data on depends upon the number of switches for which each company has provisioned facilities. Instructions are included with the spreadsheet. Additional questions regarding collocation issues are included on two separate tabs and should also be answered.

The company's response may be marked "Confidential" or "Highly Sensitive Confidential Information" pursuant to the Protective Order entered in Case No. U-13796.

Responses should be served upon the Michigan Public Service Commission Staff and upon all parties in Case No. U-13796.

The electronic spreadsheets are set up in a manner that will allow the responses to be compiled, and queried in an efficient manner. These responses should be provided in light of the SBC's filings regarding geographic areas and services to which they plan to challenge the FCC's impairment finding.

After completing the spreadsheets, please save them electronically with your company name replacing the word "question" in the title of the spreadsheet. For example, "switching\_ " should precede your company name (e.g., switching\_COMPANY NAME.xls).

All submissions should be marked with "Case No. U-13796".

All submissions should be served upon parties in Case No. U-13796 and may, in accordance with the terms of the Protective Order, be served electronically (i.e., via email or CD-Rom).

#### Verification

Upon completion of the spreadsheet, a representative of the Company should execute the verification page and include it with the response.

#### Instructions for completing the spreadsheet

All responding companies should complete the two preliminary questions:

**Preliminary Question 1(a)** -- State whether the Company completing this matrix owns one or more switches that perform basic switching functions of connecting lines to lines, lines to trunks, trunks to lines, and trunks to trunks. If the answer to this question is "no", the Company should so indicate on the matrix, and the Company is not required to complete the matrix.

**Preliminary Question 1(b)** -- State whether the Company completing this matrix, if it owns one or more switches as described in 1(a), whether those switches are used exclusively for the provision of mobile wireless telecommunications, or are exclusively used for the provision of long distance telephone service. If the answer to this question is "Yes" for any switch, the Company should so indicate on the matrix, and the Company is not required to complete the matrix with regard to those switches used exclusively for the provision of mobile wireless telecommunications or used exclusively for the provision of long distance telephone service.

**Preliminary Question 1(c)** -- State whether the Company completing this matrix, if it owns one or more switches as described in 1(a), whether any of those switches are used either to serve local telecommunications end users that are physically located in the SBC Michigan serving area or to offer wholesale local switching service to other providers serving local telecommunications end users physically located in the SBC Michigan serving territory. If the answer to this question is "No," the Company should so indicate on the matrix, and the Company is not required to complete this switching matrix. If the answer to this question is "yes," the Company should complete all sections of the matrixes applicable.

**Preliminary Question 2** -- Does the Company Identified in cell A3 obtain any DS-0/voice loops (not DS-1) via Enhanced Extended Link (or EEL) at a central office location where the Company does not have collocation. Please indicate "yes" or "no" in the appropriate space on the spreadsheet.

<b>Matrix questions</b>
Fill in the electronic spreadsheet "switching_questions.xls"
with the following information for each Michigan serving
switching entity that you have self-provisioned. These switches
may provide service to either your company's Michigan retail customers
or might be used by another carrier to provide service to its
Michigan customers (i.e., wholesale switching service). Information should only be provided for
switches owned and/or operated by the responding company.
<b>Switching questions Tab</b>
Please provide the 11-digit COMMON LANGUAGE® Location Identifier
CLLI™ of each switch used to provide qualifying service anywhere
in the state of Michigan. (Column A)
Category type of switch. Check one of the following
(End Office, Tandem Office, Multi-Function, Remote Line, Packet,
Broadband, Cellular, Other). (Columns B - I) Mark the cell with an "X" and in the cell below identify
the type of switch.
If you check Column I ("Other"), describe or identify switch type.
Number of DS0/Voice grade access (not DS-1) lines equipped. (Column J)
Number of DS0/Voice grade (do not included DS-1) access lines in use. (Column K)
Switch processor capacity in Centum Call Seconds (CCS). (Column L)
Number of DS0 lines served by this switch that provide voice-grade service to residential
customers. (Column M)
Number of DS0 lines served by this switch that provide voice-grade service to business customers.
(Column N)
Vertical coordinate of switching facility (e.g., 4634).
This is a four- or five-digit number related to the geographic
location of a switching entity found in table 7 of the Local
Exchange Routing Guider (LERG7). This should not be confused
with the Rate Center found in Table 8 of the LERG (LERG8). (Column O)
Horizontal coordinate of switching facility (e.g., 1630). See
note above. (Column P)
Switching entity street address (e.g., 660 Plaza Dr.). (Column Q)
Switching entity city (e.g., Detroit). (Column R)
Switching entity state (i.e., MI). (Column S)
Switching entity five digit zip code (e.g., 48226). (Column T)
Is this switching facility used to provide service to your own
retail customers? (Column U)
Identify, by eight-digit CLLI code, for each wire center district served (i.e., the territory served by
SBC Michigan switch) by the switch identified in Column U, identify on the basis of available
information the number of DS0 voice grade (do not include DS-1) lines that serve your own retail
customer locations. (Column V)
Is this switching facility used by another carrier to provide
service to its retail customers (i.e., wholesale switching services)? (Column X)
Identify, by eight-digit CLLI code, for each wire center district served (i.e., the territory served by
SBC Michigan switch) by the switch identified in Column X, identify on the basis of available
information the number of DS0 voice grade (do not include DS-1) lines that are serving, via another
carrier using the switch on a wholesale basis. (Column Y)
Column Z -- Identify, by eight-digit CLLI code, each wire center district served (i.e., the territory
served by SBC Michigan switch) and in the cell below the CLLI code, identify on the basis of
available information the number of DS0 voice grade (do not use DS-1) lines that serve customer
locations using 3 or fewer voice-grade lines in the wire center district identified. (Use columns AA
and beyond to provide information for each wire center district.)
<b>Collocation Tabs</b>
For each collocation arrangement the responding company has in the ILEC central office in
Michigan (where the ILEC is contesting impairment), provide the following information reported by
ILEC CLLI Code.
Fill out Collocation remaining column as directed.
Fill out the Collocation Table tab as directed in cell C2.



[illegible]

[illegible]

For each collocation arrangement identified in response to this request, provide the information in the Collocation Table tab.

Central Office (Use ILEC 8-digit wire center CLLI code)	Number Of Loops Per End-User Customer Premises	Number of Local Service End-User Customers	Type of End-User Customer	Number of Voice Only End Users Customers (This category includes loops used for fax and/or modem-only traffic.)	Number of DSL Only End-User Customers	Number of Line Shared/Line Split DSL End User Customers
CLLI						
ABC	1	e.g. 1,017	Residential	e.g. 1,000	e.g. 2	e.g. 10
	1	e.g. 540	Business	e.g. 500	e.g. 10	e.g. 10
	2		Residential			
	2		Business			
	3		Residential			
	3		Business			
	4		Residential			
	4		Business			
	5		Residential			
	5		Business			
	6		Residential			
	6		Business			
	7		Residential			
	7		Business			
	8		Residential			
	8		Business			
	9		Residential			
	9		Business			
	10		Residential			
	10		Business			
	11		Residential			
	11		Business			
	12		Residential			
	12		Business			
	13		Residential			
	13		Business			
	14		Residential			
	14		Business			
	15		Residential			
	15		Business			
	16		Residential			
	16		Business			
	17		Residential			
	17		Business			
	18		Residential			
	18		Business			

	19-24		Residential			
	19-24		Business			
	one DS-1		Residential			
	one DS-1		Business			
	more than one DS-1		Business			



**State of Michigan**  
**Before the Michigan Public Service Commission**  
**Case No. U-13796**

**VERIFICATION**

State of .....)

) SS. :

County of .....)

.....verifies and

states: I am the ..... of .....  
(Here insert the official title of the deponent) (Here insert exact name of the reporting company)

.....

I am familiar with the preparation of the foregoing information and know generally the contents thereof.  
Said information

consists of .....  
(Here insert exact identification of the information)

.....

is true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief. As to matters not actually stated upon my knowledge,

the sources of my information and the grounds for my belief are as follows: .....

.....

.....

.....

.....

Signature

<b>INSTRUCTIONS for "loop_questions.xls"</b>	
<b>Michigan Staff High-Capacity Loop Questions (for both ILECs and CLECs)</b>	
<b>FCC Rules, Sections 51.319 (a) (4), (5) and (6)</b>	
<b>All licensed telecommunication carriers operating in SBC territory should answer these questions within 14 days of service.</b>	
<b><u>General Instructions</u></b>	
The trigger information requested is to be provided on an electronic spreadsheet	
"loop_questions".xls. The spreadsheet includes a few rows of example entries. Respondents should remove the example information before entering their own information. The number of spreadsheet rows which each ILEC and CLEC will be required to provide data on depends upon the number of customer locations for which each company has provisioned facilities. Detailed instructions are attached to the spreadsheet.	
The company's response may be marked "Confidential" or "Highly Sensitive Confidential Information" pursuant to the Protective Order entered in Case No. U-13796.	
Responses should be served upon the Michigan Public Service Commission Staff and upon all parties in Case No. U-13796.	
After completing the spreadsheets, please save them electronically with your company name replacing the word "question" in the title of the spreadsheet. For example	
loop_ should precede your company name (e.g.,	
loop_COMPANY NAME.xls").	
All submissions should be marked with " <b>Case No. U-13796</b> ".	
All submissions should be served upon parties in Case No. U-13796 and may, in accordance with the terms of the Protective Order, be served electronically (i.e., via email or CD-Rom).	
<b><u>Verification</u></b>	
Upon completion of the spreadsheet, a representative of the Company should execute the verification page and include it with the response	
<b><u>Instructions for completing the spreadsheet</u></b>	
Fill in the electronic spreadsheet "loop_trigger_questions.xls" with the following information for each Michigan customer location for which your company has deployed high-capacity loop facilities.	
These facilities might be used either by your own retail customers, or by an unaffiliated carrier's customer. Include facilities for both those customers served entirely by your own facilities and those for customers served by attaching your own optronics to activate dark fiber	

transmission facilities provided by another carrier.	
<b>This matrix need not be completed by companies who do not <u>own</u> high-capacity loop facilities that are deployed in Michigan. For the purpose of this matrix, high capacity loop facilities you may rent or lease from SBC Michigan do not apply. If you do not <u>own</u> high-capacity loop facilities in Michigan, then so indicate, and you do not have to fill out the matrix."</b>	
Street address of customer served by high-capacity loop (e.g., 10 South Canal (Column A)	
City of customer served by high-capacity loop ( e.g., Chicago). (Column B)	
State of customer served by high-capacity loop (i.e., IL). (Column C)	
Five-digit zip code address of customer served by high-capacity loop (e.g., 60602). (Column D)	
Customer Location V Coordinate (if readily available, e.g., 4700). (Column E)	
Customer Location H Coordinate (if readily available, e.g., 1640). (Column F)	
High-capacity loop type (dark fiber, DS1, DS3). (Column G – I)	
Customer serving wire center eight-digit CLLI code (e.g., CHCGILWJDS0). (Column J)	
Serving wire center V Coordinate (e.g., 4639). (Column K)	
Serving wire center H Coordinate (e.g., 1629). (Column L)	
The number of circuits serving the customer location (e.g., the number of circuits at DS1 level, the number of circuits at DS3 level, or the number of dark fibers.). (Columns M - O)	
Does your company have access to the entire customer location, including each individual unit within that location? [Section 51.319 (a)(5)(ii)(B)] (Column P)	For each answer for column P through U, provide your answer by each type of facility (i.e, a specific answer for dark fiber, DS-1, and/or DS-3)
Is the customer location served entirely by your company's facilities? (Column Q)	"
Is the customer location served by attaching your company's optronics to activate dark fiber transmission facilities provided by another carrier? (Column R)	"
Indicate if the customer location is served via an unaffiliated carrier to which your company has provided dark fiber. (Column S)	"
Is this high-capacity loop facility used to provide service to your company's retail customers? (Column T)	"
Is this high-capacity loop facility used by another carrier to provide service to its retail customers? (Column U)	"



[illegible]

**State of Michigan**  
**Before the Michigan Public Service Commission**  
**Case No. U-13796**

**VERIFICATION**

State of .....

) ss. :

County of .....

.....verifies and

states: I am the ..... of .....  
(Here insert the official title of the deponent) (Here insert exact name of the reporting company)

.....

I am familiar with the preparation of the foregoing information and know generally the contents thereof.  
Said information

consists of .....  
(Here insert exact identification of the information)

.....

is true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief. As to matters not actually stated upon my knowledge,  
the sources of my information and the grounds for my belief are as follows: .....

.....

.....

.....

.....

Signature

<b>INSTRUCTIONS for "transport_questions.xls"</b>	
<b>Michigan Staff Transport Questions (for both ILECs and CLECs)</b> <b>FCC Rules, Sections 51.319 (e) (1) and (2)</b> <b>All licensed telecommunication carriers operating in SBC territory should answer these questions within 14 days of service.</b>	
<b>General Instructions</b>	
The trigger information requested is to be provided on an electronic spreadsheet: "transport_questions.xls"	
This spreadsheet includes a few rows of example entries. Respondents should remove the example information before entering their own information. The number of spreadsheet rows which each ILEC and CLEC will be required to provide data on depends upon the number of transport routes for which each company has provisioned facilities. Detailed instructions are attached to the spreadsheet.	
The company's response may be marked "Confidential" or "Highly Sensitive Confidential Information" pursuant to the Protective Order entered in Case No. U-13796.	
Responses should be served upon the Michigan Public Service Commission Staff and upon all parties in Case No. U-13796.	
The electronic spreadsheets are set up in a manner that will allow the responses to be compiled, and queried in an efficient manner. These responses should be provided in light of SBC's filings regarding geographic areas and services to which they plan to challenge the FCC's impairment finding.	
After completing the spreadsheets, please save them electronically with your company name replacing the word "question" in the title of the spreadsheet. For example, "transport_", should precede your company name (e.g.,	
transport_COMPANY NAME.xls"). Send on 3.5 diskettes or compact disk (CD) within 14 days of service.	
All submissions should be marked with " <b>Case No. U-13796</b> ".	
All submissions should be served upon parties in Case No. U-13796 and may, in accordance with the terms of the Protective Order, be served electronically (i.e., via email or CD-Rom).	
<b>Verification</b>	
Upon completion of the spreadsheet, a representative of the Company should execute the verification page and include it with the response	
<b>Instructions for completing the spreadsheet</b>	
FCC Rules, Sections 51.319 (e) (1) and (2)	
<b><u>This matrix need not be completed by companies who do not own or lease from entity other than SBC Michigan DS-1 or DS-3, or dark fiber transport facilities that are deployed in Michigan. For the purpose of this matrix, DS-1 or DS-3, or dark fiber transport facilities you may rent or lease from SBC Michigan do not apply. If you do not own or lease from entity other than SBC Michigan DS-1 or DS-3, or dark fiber transport facilities facilities in Michigan, then so indicate, and you do not have to fill out the matrix.</u></b>	
Fill in the electronic spreadsheet "transport_questions.xls" with the following information for each Michigan CLLI to CLLI (ILEC central office to ILEC central office) transport route for which your company has self-provisioned transport facilities. These facilities might be used to provide service to your company's own customers or by another carrier to provide service to its customers. For purposes of this question, "transport facilities" (a) does not include unbundled facilities obtained from ILECs, and (b) does include dark fiber. A transport route between two points may pass through two or more intermediate wire centers or switches, including CLEC locations. The physical facilities used to serve a route need not follow the same physical path as the ILEC facilities.	

Complete each spread sheet completely (i.e., the first is for ILEC provided collocation only and the second include alternatively obtained collocation (i.e., collocation hotels). Note: complete spreadsheet rows once for transport route pair (e.g., for a transport route between Detroit and Birmingham, complete spreadsheet rows for either DTRTMIBH to BRHMMIMN or for BRHMMIMN to DTRTMIBH, but not for both).	
Collocation arrangement CLLI code (e.g., CLLIXXXXXX). (Column A) In the first row of queries (row 4), "collocation arrangements" means ILEC-provided, including shared collocation space, only and does not include non-ILEC locations (e.g., "collocation hotels") in which your company is collocated with other carriers. In the second row of queries (row 17), "collocation arrangements" includes ILEC-provided, including shared collocation space, and also includes non-ILEC locations (e.g., "collocation hotels") in which your companyh is collocated with other carriers.	
Collocation arrangement street address (e.g., 10 South Canal) (Column B)	
Collocation arrangement city (e.g., Chicago). (Column C)	
Collocation arrangement state (i.e., IL). (Column D)	
Collocation arrangement five digit zip code (e.g., 60602). (Column E)	
Collocation arrangement vertical coordinate (e.g., 4620). This is a four- or five-digit number related to the geographic location of a switching entity found in table 7 of the Local Exchange Routing Guider (LERG7). This should not be confused with the Rate Center found in Table 8 of the LERG (LERG8). (Column F)	
Collocation arrangement horizontal coordinate (e.g.,1632). See note above. (Column G)	
Type of collocation arrangement (caged, cageless, or virtual). (Columns H –J)	
The number of transport circuits connecting the collocation facilities at each end of the route. (Column K)	
For each transport route to a connected Collocation Arrangement (i.e., for each CLLI to CLLI pair) (e.g., CLLIXXXXXX to CLLIXXXXZZ).	
Dedicated transport type (dark fiber, DS1, DS3). (Columns L – N)	
The number of dark fibers, the number of DS1 level transport circuits, and/or the number of DS3 level transport circuits. (Columns O – Q)	
Connected collocation CLLI code (e.g., CLLIXXXXZZ). (Column R)	
Connected collocation arrangement street address (e.g., 602 N. York Ave.). (Column S)	
Connected collocation arrangement city (e.g., Bensenville). (Column T)	
Connected collocation arrangement state (i.e., IL). (Column U)	
Connected collocation arrangement five digit zip code. (e.g., 60106). (Column V)	
Connected collocation arrangement V coordinate (e.g., 4600). (Column W)	
Connected collocation arrangement H coordinate (e.g.,1600). (Column X)	
	If the answer to the questions in column Y and/or Z are "Yes", please specify each type of facility used (I.e., dark fiber, DS-1, DS-3)
Is this transport facility used to provide service to your own retail customers? (Column Y)	
Is this transport facility used by another carrier to provide service to its customers? (Column Z)	"



[illegible]

[illegible]

**State of Michigan**  
**Before the Michigan Public Service Commission**  
**Case No. U-13796**

**VERIFICATION**

State of .....

) ss. :

County of .....

.....verifies and

states: I am the ..... of .....  
(Here insert the official title of the deponent) (Here insert exact name of the reporting company)

.....

I am familiar with the preparation of the foregoing information and know generally the contents thereof.  
Said information

consists of .....  
(Here insert exact identification of the information)

.....

is true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief. As to matters not actually stated upon my knowledge,  
the sources of my information and the grounds for my belief are as follows: .....

.....

.....

.....

.....

Signature

Respectfully submitted,

**MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE  
COMMISSION STAFF**

Steven D. Hughey (P32203)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Public Service Division  
6545 Mercantile Way, Suite 15  
Lansing, MI 48911  
Telephone: (517) 241-6680

**DATED: October 31, 2003**

**STATE OF MICHIGAN**  
**BEFORE THE MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION**

\* \* \*

<b>In the matter, on the Commission's own motion, )</b>	
<b>to facilitate the implementation of the Federal )</b>	
<b>Communication Commission's Triennial Review )</b>	<b>Case No. U-13796</b>
<b>determination in Michigan. )</b>	
_____ )	

<b>In the matter, on the Commission's )</b>	
<b>own motion, to investigate and to )</b>	
<b>implement, if necessary, )</b>	<b>Case No. U-13891</b>
<b>a batch cut migration process. )</b>	

**PROTECTIVE ORDER**

**It is hereby ORDERED that:**

This Order is a mandatory protective order entered pursuant to § 210 of the Michigan Telecommunications Act, MCL 4210. Its terms shall apply in both of the captioned proceedings (hereinafter "proceeding" or "proceedings") listed above.

1. Confidential Information

(a) For purposes of this Order only, "Confidential Information" consists of all documents, data, information, studies, cost study information, models, diagrams, flowcharts, and other materials, and includes but is not limited to oral or other tangible or intangible form such as ideas, concepts, and know-how, designated as confidential (using one or more of the methods of identification described below) by a producing party and furnished pursuant to requests for information or admissions, depositions, or otherwise during this proceeding. For purposes of this Order, "Confidential Information" also consists of underlying work papers, cost data supporting the studies, as well as customer usage data, marketing studies and contracts between

providers and other trade secrets and proprietary, commercial or financial information as those terms are used in Section 210 of the MTA, MCL 484.2210(3). “Confidential Information” shall not include information contained in the public files of any federal or state agency that is subject to disclosure under relevant law, nor shall it include information that, at the time it is provided through discovery or otherwise during these proceedings or prior thereto, is or was public or that becomes public other than through disclosure in violation of this Order. “Confidential Information” shall not include information found by the Administrative Law Judge, the Commission or a court of competent jurisdiction not to merit the protection afforded Confidential Information under the terms of this Order.

(b) This Order shall be construed in accordance with the “Critical Infrastructure Information Act of 2002,” Pub. L. 107-296, codified at 6 U.S.C.A § 101 et seq.

## 2. Use of Confidential Information

(a) Except as limited in this paragraph (2), and subject to paragraphs (3) and (4) of this Order, Confidential Information made available pursuant to this Order shall be used only by the following persons:

- (1) receiving party’s counsel of record and any attorneys and legal assistants employed by or associated with counsel of record and acting at the direction of counsel of record;
- (2) regulatory personnel employed by the receiving party who are acting at the direction of counsel;
- (3) outside consultants retained by the receiving party and who are under the direction of either counsel or regulatory personnel as set forth in paragraph 2 (a)(2);
- (4) persons requested by counsel of record to prepare testimony, affidavits, exhibits or other materials for submission to the Commission on behalf of the receiving party.

(b) Confidential Information made available pursuant to this Order shall be used only by the persons listed in paragraph (2)(a), and as described herein, provided that such regulatory personnel, witness(es), employees and independent consultants granted access to confidential information as provided herein may not be engaged in strategic or competitive decision-making for planning, marketing, or selling telephone services or other offerings, strategic or business planning; competitive assessment; and/or network planning or procurement on behalf of the receiving party, unless the producing party gives prior written authorization for specific individuals in the prohibited categories above to review the Confidential Information, which shall not be unreasonably withheld, delayed or denied. If the producing party refuses to respond in a timely manner to a request for such authorization, the receiving party may, for good cause shown, request a ruling or an order from the Administrative Law Judge allowing an individual involved in the prohibited categories above to have access to the Confidential Information received by a party. The producing party shall be given the opportunity to respond (either in writing or orally in a hearing before the Administrative Law Judge, at the administrative Law Judge's discretion) to the request for access before any ruling or order granting such access is issued by the Administrative Law Judge.

(c) In the event that a party has fewer than four employees with relevant expertise other than counsel who are entitled to receive any particular Confidential Information, such party may designate three employees who shall be entitled to receive such Confidential Information solely for purposes of such party's participation in this proceeding. The receiving party shall inform the producing party of the names, job titles and job descriptions of the three designated employees. A producing party who objects to any of the party's three designated

employees receiving any particular Confidential Information shall expeditiously bring an appropriate motion before the Administrative Law Judge for resolution of the matter.

(d) Confidential Information should be requested, reviewed, used or disclosed only by or to the persons authorized under this Order and only in accordance with the terms specified herein. The use, review or disclosure of Confidential Information is limited to the following purposes:

- (1) for use in connection with this proceeding or any administrative or judicial appeals thereof;
- (2) for use in other proceedings to be conducted by this Commission in connection with or arising from these proceedings, and
- (3) for use in proceedings similar to this proceeding conducted by other state public utility commissions or the Federal Communications Commission regarding matters subsequent to the Federal Communications Commission *Triennial Review Order—In the Matter of Review of Section 251 Unbundling Obligations of Incumbent Local Exchange Carriers* CC Docket No. 01-338, *Report and Order on Remand (rel. August 21, 2003)*, provided that prior to use or disclosure of the Confidential Information in such similar proceedings, such other state public utility commission(s) or the Federal Communications Commission has in effect a protective order, or has approved a nondisclosure agreement, that provides substantially similar protections for the Confidential Information.

(e) Notwithstanding the above, handling of the Confidential Information by clerical personnel for clerical purposes at the direction of persons specified in Section 2(a) shall not be deemed a violation of this Order.

(f) Prior to the release of the Confidential Information to any party in these proceedings, counsel for the requesting party shall provide counsel for the producing party signed acknowledgments (attached as EXHIBIT A to this Protective Order) from each individual



or entity described in paragraph (2) who will receive confidential information that each individual or entity will abide by the terms of this Order.

3. Highly Sensitive Confidential Information.

(a) Certain highly sensitive Confidential Information may, in good faith, be designated as “HIGHLY SENSITIVE CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION.” Such HIGHLY SENSITIVE CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION shall be made available only to the receiving party’s counsel, as well as to the receiving party’s witnesses, personnel assisting those witness with preparing their testimony (not to exceed a reasonable number of necessary support persons for any one witness) who are not in the aforementioned prohibited categories, employees in the regulatory organization (not to exceed eight such (non-counsel) employees, except that a receiving party may request in writing permission to make available HIGHLY SENSITIVE CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION to one or more additional employees (beyond the eight already designated) in the regulatory organization, and the producing party may give prior written authorization for the specific additional individuals, which shall not be unreasonably withheld, delayed or denied, to review such HIGHLY SENSITIVE CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION) who are not in the aforementioned prohibited categories, and independent consultants in this proceedings who have a need to know and who are not engaged in strategic or competitive decision-making for developing, planning, marketing, or selling telephone services or other offerings, strategic or business planning; competitive assessment; and/or network planning or procurement on behalf of the receiving party.

(b) Access by such counsel, the receiving party’s witnesses and independent consultants whom are not part of the aforementioned prohibited categories to HIGHLY SENSITIVE CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION shall be given only after each such counsel, witness or independent consultant has signed Exhibits A and B, attached hereto. A receiving party must deliver copies of Exhibits A and B (via email and/or confirmed facsimile transmission) to counsel for a producing party before that receiving party can receive and review HIGHLY SENSITIVE CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION. Access by the receiving party’s witnesses and independent consultants whom are a part of the aforementioned prohibited categories to HIGHLY SENSITIVE CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION shall be given only after written consent of the Producing Party and only after each witness or independent

consultant has signed Exhibits A and B, attached hereto. If the parties cannot agree on such access within a reasonable time, the parties may seek rapid resolution from the Administrative Law Judge or the Commission. The producing party shall be given the opportunity to respond to the request for access before any order granting such access is issued by the ALJ or the Commission.

(c) In the event that a party has fewer than four employees with relevant expertise other than counsel who are entitled to receive any particular HIGHLY SENSITIVE CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION, such party may designate three employees who shall be entitled to receive such HIGHLY SENSITIVE CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION solely for purposes of such party's participation in the Proceeding. The receiving party shall inform the producing party of the names, job titles and job descriptions of the three designated employees. A producing party who objects to any of the party's three designated employees receiving any particular HIGHLY SENSITIVE CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION shall expeditiously bring an appropriate motion before the Administrative Law Judge for resolution of the matter.

#### 4. Third Party Confidential Information

(a) During the course of these proceedings non-parties may be required to submit Confidential Information to parties or to the Commission pursuant to subpoena or otherwise. Such third party information that is properly labeled HIGHLY SENSITIVE CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION and/or Confidential Information shall be subject to the procedures and protections provided under this Protective Order.

#### 5. Delivery of Documentation

The Confidential Information submitted pursuant to this Order should be provided as follows:

(a) Confidential Information filed with the Commission shall be provided to requesting parties within 24 hours of the party's respective request, or as soon thereafter as reasonably possible;

(b) Any underlying work papers and data subsequently requested by a party shall be submitted to that party within three days of receipt by the producing party of the request, or as soon thereafter as reasonably possible, to the extent to which discovery is allowed or conducted in this proceeding regarding such work papers and data.

(c) Delivery of the Confidential Information to counsel will constitute delivery to a party. The producing party should clearly denote on each and every document submitted that information which it deems confidential pursuant to this Order. If documents which are served are available in electronic format, they also shall be served electronically to the parties.

6. Procedures

(a) Testimony/Affidavits. If the requesting party refers to Confidential Information in testimony or affidavits, such reference(s) shall be placed in a sealed record as (an) exhibit(s) to such testimony or affidavits.

(b) Seal. While in the custody of the Commission, the materials containing Confidential Information shall be marked, “[Insert Producing Party Name, i.e., SBC] CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION” (or, where applicable, “[Insert Producing Party Name, i.e., SBC] HIGHLY SENSITIVE CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION”) and shall be placed in a separate portion of the record under seal, and the parties request that the Commission shall take reasonable steps to protect such material from disclosure to persons not subject to the Order.

(c) Discovery. The procedures specified in this Order shall apply to all Confidential Information provided to any party or parties pursuant to discovery requests made prior to, during, or after hearings in cases to which the Order pertains.

(d) Transcripts, Pleadings and Briefs. Any references to Confidential Information in the transcripts, exhibits, briefs, pleadings and comments in this proceeding shall be placed under seal and shall be placed in a separate section of such documents and submitted to the Commission under seal.

(e) Hearing Room Procedure. If Confidential Information is to be used in oral testimony, cross-examination or argument, it shall be on sufficient notice to allow the presiding officer an opportunity to take measures within his or her control to protect the confidentiality of the information.

(f) Segregation of Files. Parts of any writing, depositions reduced to writing, written examinations, interrogatories and answers thereto, or other written references or notes to Confidential Information, if filed with the Commission, shall be sealed, segregated in the files of the Commission, and withheld from inspection by any party not bound by the terms of this Order, unless such Confidential Information is released from the restrictions of this Order, either through agreement of the parties or, after notice to the parties and hearing, pursuant to an order of the Commission and/or final order of a court of competent jurisdiction.

(g) Use of Sealed Information. No information under seal pursuant to this Order shall be used in any manner except pursuant to Commission order, or final order of a court of competent jurisdiction after notice to the producing party and hearing, either unsealing such information or providing for the use of such information.

7. Preservation of Confidentiality

No person who is afforded access to any Confidential Information by reason of this Order shall disclose the Confidential Information to anyone not specifically authorized to receive such information pursuant to the terms of this Order. Nor shall such persons use the

Confidential Information in any manner inconsistent with this Order. All persons afforded access to Confidential Information pursuant to this Order shall keep the Confidential Information secure in accordance with the purposes and intent of this Order and shall adopt all reasonable precautions to assure continued confidentiality, including precautions against unauthorized copying, use or disclosure thereof.

8. Rights Under the Order

The parties retain the right to challenge whether a document or information is in fact Confidential Information, including whether information is, in fact, proprietary information and whether such information can be withheld under paragraph (1) of this Order. The treatment of Confidential Information under this Order is not of precedential effect for other proceedings, except as indicated in this Order, and the Parties retain their rights to dispute such treatment in this or any other proceeding.

A party that seeks or intends to disclose, on the public record, information taken directly from materials produced by another party, and that has been identified as Confidential Information by the producing party, must, before actually disclosing the information on the public record, first do one of the following: (a) contact counsel for the producing party and seek permission to place the information on the public record; (b) take affirmative steps to confirm that the information is otherwise public information and falls within the exclusions contained in Paragraph 10 herein; or (c) challenge the confidential nature of the Confidential Information and obtain a ruling that said information is not confidential or may be disclosed.

9. Retention of Documents

Within sixty (60) days of completion of these proceedings, including any administrative or judicial review, all documents containing Confidential Information provided under the terms of this Order shall be returned to the producing party, except that any notes or comments or materials prepared by counsel for the requesting parties need not be returned. The obligation to return Confidential Information shall be satisfied by return of all the Confidential Information or submission of an affidavit that the Confidential Information has been destroyed, returned, or, following reasonable search, is lost and cannot be located. Counsel for the

requesting party or parties shall have the right to retain copies of the pleadings, orders, transcripts, briefs, comments and exhibits in these proceedings.

10. Inapplicability

The obligations of this Order shall not apply to any Confidential Information if a Party can demonstrate that it:

- (a) is or becomes available to the public through no breach of this Order;
- (b) was previously known by the party without any obligation to hold it in confidence;
- (c) is received from a third party free to disclose such information without restriction;
- (d) is independently developed by the party without the use of Confidential Information furnished to the party;
- (e) is approved for release by written authorization of the provider of the Confidential Information, but only to the extent of such authorization;
- (f) is required by law or regulation to be disclosed, but only to the extent and for the purposes of such required disclosure, or is submitted to a regulatory commission, agency or court of competent jurisdiction under a protective agreement or order;
- (g) is disclosed in response to a valid order of a court of competent jurisdiction or governmental body, but only to the extent and for the purposes of such order, and only if the recipient first notifies the producer of the Confidential Information to seek an appropriate protective order.

11. Violation of Order

In the event any party, person or entity subject to the terms of this Order fails to maintain the confidentiality of Confidential Information or otherwise violates the terms hereof, the presiding Officer or Commission may impose such sanctions upon the offending party, person or entity as the presiding officer or Commission deem appropriate under the circumstances, which may include, but are not limited to, any sanctions provided for under the Michigan Rules of Court.

Should a party, a party's representative, or any other person or entity that has properly obtained access to Confidential Information under this Order violate any of its terms, it shall immediately convey that fact to the Commission and to the producing party. Further, should such violation consist of improper disclosure or use of Confidential Information, the violating party shall take all necessary steps to remedy the improper disclosure or use. The violating party also shall immediately notify the Commission, the presiding officer, and the producing party, in writing, of the identity of each person known or reasonably suspected to have obtained the Confidential Information through any disclosure.

Any disclosure deemed to cause irreparable harm not capable of quantifying loss may entitle the producing party to injunctive relief.

A party, a party representative or other person or entity that breaches this Protective Order remains subject to sanctions regardless of whether or not the producing party could have discovered the violation earlier than when it actually was discovered. In addition, the sanctions for any violation of this Protective Order apply to inadvertent accidental violations, as well as intentional disclosures. Nothing in this Protective Order shall limit any other rights and



remedies available to the producing party at law or equity against any party using Confidential Information in a manner not authorized by this Protective Order.

**IT IS SO ORDERED:**

---

Administrative Law Judge

Date:

EXHIBIT A  
TO  
PROTECTIVE ORDER

Michigan Public Service Commission Docket No. U-13796 & U-13891

---

I have received and read and agree to comply with and be bound by the terms and conditions of this Protective Order.

SIGNATURE: \_\_\_\_\_

NAME PRINTED: \_\_\_\_\_

TITLE: \_\_\_\_\_

ADDRESS: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

REPRESENTING: \_\_\_\_\_

EMPLOYER: \_\_\_\_\_

DATE: \_\_\_\_\_

EXHIBIT B  
TO  
PROTECTIVE ORDER

Michigan Public Service Commission Docket No. U-13796 & U-13891

---

STATEMENT OF RECEIPT OF HIGHLY SENSITIVE CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION

I, \_\_\_\_\_, acknowledge receipt of the Highly Sensitive Confidential Information described below and agree to maintain in accordance with the terms of this Protective Order. These copies are to remain in the possession of:

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Title: \_\_\_\_\_

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

Job  
Description: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

Signed on this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_ 2003.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Name (Printed)

Description of Highly Sensitive Confidential Information:

Data Request Number:

Party who originally

propounded data request: